

---

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE ELEVENTH CIRCUIT**

---

**Nos. 11-14532-CC and No. 11-14674-CC**

**UNITED STATES,  
*Plaintiff-Appellant,***  
v.  
**STATE OF ALABAMA, ET AL.,  
*Defendants-Appellees.***

---

**Nos. 11-14535-CC and 11-14675-CC**

**HISPANIC INTEREST COALITION OF ALABAMA, ET AL.  
*Plaintiff-Appellant,***  
v.  
**ROBERT BENTLEY, ET AL.,  
*Defendants-Appellees.***

---

**On Appeal from the United States District Court  
for the Northern District of Alabama  
Case Nos. 5:11-cv-02484-SLB & 2:11-cv-2746-SLB**

---

**REPLY IN SUPPORT OF OPPOSED MOTION TO PARTIALLY VACATE  
INJUNCTION PENDING APPEAL**

---

R. Cooper Shattuck  
*Legal Advisor to the Governor*  
**OFFICE OF GOVERNOR OF ALABAMA**  
Legal Office, N103  
600 Dexter Avenue  
Montgomery, AL 36130  
Telephone: (334) 242-7120  
*Counsel for Governor Bentley*

Luther Strange  
*Attorney General*  
John C. Neiman, Jr.  
*Solicitor General*  
**OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL**  
501 Washington Avenue  
Montgomery, Alabama 36130-0152  
Telephone: (334) 242-7300  
Facsimile: (334) 353-8440  
*Attorneys for Appellees*

June 7, 2012

**Certificate of Interested Persons in *HICA v. Bentley*,  
Nos. 11-14535-CC & 11-14675-CC**

Pursuant to 11th Cir. Rule 26.1-1, counsel for Appellees/Cross-Appellants  
certify that the following have an interest in the outcome of this appeal:

[no new entries]

**Certificate of Interested Persons in *United States v. Alabama*,  
Nos. 11-14532-CC & 11-14674-CC**

Pursuant to 11th Cir. Rule 26.1-1, counsel for Appellees/Cross-Appellants  
certify that the following have an interest in the outcome of this appeal:

[no new entries]

**REPLY IN SUPPORT OF  
OPPOSED MOTION TO PARTIALLY VACATE INJUNCTION PENDING APPEAL**

Appellees offer the following in reply to the separate oppositions filed by the United States and the HICA Plaintiffs.

1. The United States correctly recognizes that the motion to vacate turns on whether this Court issued the injunction based on assertions, like the HICA Plaintiffs', that Alabama Code §31-13-29 "reache[d] into every aspect of everyday life for immigrants in Alabama, including, *inter alia*: water and sewage services; sanitation, garbage, and recycling services; housing and building occupancy licenses; obtaining a house number; recording a document or engaging in any activity in a probate office; obtaining an animal license; or any sort of business license or car tag, among other publicly provided services." *HICA* Blue Br. 42-43 (citations and footnotes omitted). If the Court did not base its injunction on this more expansive interpretation of §31-13-29, then the recent amendment of the statute does not provide any occasion for the Court to reconsider the injunction. But if the Court did base its injunction on the expansive interpretation, then it should vacate that portion of the injunction because Appellants no longer have a substantial likelihood of prevailing on their claim that §31-13-29 is preempted. To the extent that the United States is arguing that §31-13-29 is preempted even under

the more narrow construction, the United States is wrong for the reasons given in the parties' briefs on the merits. *See U.S. Red Br. 43-46; HICA Red Br. 32-34.*

Although the United States now distances itself from the more expansive interpretation, *see U.S. Opp. 3-4*, the State Defendants understood the United States to be wholeheartedly embracing that interpretation, for the first time, at oral argument. And it was only after that oral argument, rather than when the United States first sought an injunction pending appeal or when it submitted its briefs, that the Court enjoined §31-13-29.

2. Meanwhile, the HICA Plaintiffs have missed the point. In addition to the initial briefing on the Plaintiffs' motions for injunction pending appeal, this Court now has received eight merits briefs and held oral argument on these issues. Appellees' Motion cross-referenced those briefs, *see Mot. 3* (citing *U.S. Red Br. 43-46; HICA Red Br. 32-34*), and Rule 27 did not require either side to burden the Court by repeating all its arguments concerning §31-13-29 at this point. Only the Court knows whether it enjoined §31-13-29 based on Plaintiffs' broad interpretation. If it did, it should vacate the injunction.

Because the matter really is that simple, there is no need to respond, jot-for-jot, to the arguments the HICA Plaintiffs repeat in their opposition. It bears noting, however, that in leading off by claiming that Appellees' argument is a "gross

misreading” of “*Chamber of Commerce v. Whiting*, 131 S. Ct. 1968 (2011),” the HICA Plaintiffs are, to borrow their own phrase, engaging in a “gross misreading” of what the Appellees have said in their briefs. HICA Opp. 6. The briefs themselves set out the argument Appellees actually have made, and Appellees will rest on what those briefs say. Based on these arguments and Alabama’s pressing interest in enforcing its laws, Appellees respectfully ask the Court to vacate, as soon as possible, the portion of the injunction covering §31-13-29.

Respectfully submitted,

LUTHER STRANGE (ASB-0036-G42L)  
*Attorney General*

BY:

s/ John C. Neiman, Jr.

John C. Neiman, Jr. (ASB-8093-O68N)  
*Solicitor General*

**OFFICE OF THE ALABAMA ATTORNEY GENERAL**  
501 Washington Avenue  
Montgomery, Alabama 36130-0152  
Telephone: 334.242.7300  
Facsimile: 334.353.8440  
[jneiman@ago.state.al.us](mailto:jneiman@ago.state.al.us)

*Attorneys for the Appellees*

OF COUNSEL:

R. Cooper Shattuck  
LEGAL ADVISOR TO THE GOVERNOR  
Legal Office, N103  
600 Dexter Avenue  
Montgomery, AL 36130

(334) 242-7120  
cooper.shattuck@governor.alabama.gov

*Counsel for Governor Robert Bentley*

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on June 7, 2012, I electronically filed the above and foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the PACER/CM/ECF system, and served the following attorneys by electronic mail:

Mary Bauer (ASB-1181-R76B)  
Samuel Brooke (ASB-1172-L60B)  
SOUTHERN POVERTY LAW  
CENTER  
400 Washington Ave.  
Montgomery, Alabama 36104  
T: (334) 956-8200  
*mary.bauer@splcenter.org*  
*samuel.brooke@splcenter.org*

Michelle R. Lapointe  
Kristi Graunke  
Naomi Tsu  
Daniel Werner  
SOUTHERN POVERTY LAW  
CENTER  
233 Peachtree St., NE, Suite 2150  
Atlanta, Georgia 30303  
T: (404) 521-6700  
*michelle.lapointe@splcenter.org*  
*kristi.graunke@splcenter.org*  
*naomi.tsu@splcenter.org*  
*daniel.werner@splcenter.org*

Sin Yen Ling  
ASIAN LAW CAUCUS  
55 Columbus Avenue  
San Francisco, California 94111  
T: (415) 896-1701 x 110  
*sinyenL@asianlawcaucus.org*

Andre Segura  
Elora Mukherjee  
Omar C. Jadwat  
Lee Gelernt  
Michael K. T. Tan  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES  
UNION FOUNDATION  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, New York 10004  
T: (212) 549-2660  
*asegura@aclu.org*  
*ojadwat@aclu.org*  
*lgelernt@aclu.org*  
*mtan@aclu.org*  
*emukherjee@aclu.org*

Cecillia D. Wang  
Katherine Desormeau  
Kenneth J. Sugarman  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES  
UNION FOUNDATION  
IMMIGRANTS' RIGHTS PROJECT  
39 Drumm Street  
San Francisco, California 94111  
T: (415) 343-0775  
*cwang@aclu.org*  
*kdesormeau@aclu.org*  
*irp\_ks@aclu.org*



Erin E. Oshiro  
ASIAN AMERICAN JUSTICE  
CENTER, MEMBER OF THE ASIAN  
AMERICAN CENTER FOR  
ADVANCING JUSTICE  
1140 Connecticut Ave., NW  
Suite 1200  
Washington, DC 20036  
T: (202) 296-2300  
*eoshiro@advancingequality.org*

Foster S. Maer  
Ghita Schwarz  
Diana S. Sen  
LATINOJUSTICE PRLDEF  
99 Hudson St., 14<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10013  
T: (212) 219-3360  
*fmaer@latinojustice.org*  
*gschwarz@latinojustice.org*  
*dsen@latinojustice.org*

G. Brian Spears  
1126 Ponce de Leon Ave., N.E.  
Atlanta, Georgia 30306  
T: (404) 872-7086  
*bspears@mindspring.com*

Chris Newman  
Jessica Karp  
NATIONAL DAY LABORER  
ORGANIZING NETWORK  
675 S. Park View St., Suite B  
Los Angeles, California 90057  
T: (213) 380-2785  
*newman@ndlon.org*  
*jkarp@ndlon.org*

Linton Joaquin  
Karen C. Tumlin  
Shiu-Ming Cheer  
Melissa S. Keaney  
NATIONAL IMMIGRATION LAW  
CENTER  
3435 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 2850  
Los Angeles, California 90010  
T: (213) 639-3900  
*joaquin@nilc.org*  
*tumlin@nilc.org*  
*cheer@nilc.org*  
*keaney@nilc.org*

Tanya Broder  
NATIONAL IMMIGRATION LAW  
CENTER  
405 14<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 1400  
Oakland, California 94612  
T: (510) 663-8282  
*broder@nilc.org*

Herman Watson, Jr. (ASB-6781-  
O74H)  
Eric J. Artrip (ASB-9673-I68E)  
Rebekah Keith McKinney (ASB-3137-  
T64J)  
Watson, McKinney & Artrip, LLP  
203 Greene Street  
P.O. Box 18368  
Huntsville, Alabama 35804  
T: (256) 536-7423  
*watson@watsonmckinney.com*  
*mckinney@watsonmckinney.com*  
*artrip@watsonmckinney.com*

Allison Neal (ASB 3377-I72N)  
AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES  
UNION OF ALABAMA  
FOUNDATION  
207 Montgomery St., Suite 910  
Montgomery, Alabama 36104  
T: (334) 265-2754 x 203  
[aneal@aclualabama.org](mailto:aneal@aclualabama.org)

Freddy Rubio (ASB-5403-D62R)  
Cooperating Attorney, ACLU of  
Alabama Foundation  
Rubio Law Firm, P.C.  
438 Carr Avenue, Suite 1  
Birmingham, Alabama 35209  
T: 205-443-7858  
[frubio@rubiofirm.com](mailto:frubio@rubiofirm.com)

Ben Bruner (ASB-BRU-001)  
THE BRUNER LAW FIRM  
1904 Berryhill Road  
Montgomery, Alabama 36117  
T: (334) 201 0835  
[brunerlawfirm@gmail.com](mailto:brunerlawfirm@gmail.com)

J.R. Brooks  
Taylor P. Brooks  
LANIER FORD SHAVER  
& PAYNE, P.C.  
P.O. Box 2087  
Huntsville, AL 35804  
[jrb@lfsf.com](mailto:jrb@lfsf.com)  
[tpb@lanierford.com](mailto:tpb@lanierford.com)

Donald B. Sweeney, Jr.  
BRADLEY ARANT BOULT  
CUMMINGS, LLP  
1819 5<sup>th</sup> Ave. N  
Birmingham, AL 35203-2120  
[dsweeney@babbc.com](mailto:dsweeney@babbc.com)

Victor Viramontes  
Martha L. Gomez  
MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL  
DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL  
FUND  
634 S. Spring Street, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Los Angeles, California 90014  
T: (213) 629-2512 x 133  
[vviramontes@maldef.org](mailto:vviramontes@maldef.org)  
[mgomez@maldef.org](mailto:mgomez@maldef.org)

Nina Perales  
MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL  
DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL  
FUND  
110 Broadway, Suite 300  
San Antonio, Texas 78205  
T: (210) 224-55476 x 206  
[nperales@maldef.org](mailto:nperales@maldef.org)

Amy Pedersen  
MEXICAN AMERICAN LEGAL  
DEFENSE AND EDUCATIONAL  
FUND  
1016 16<sup>th</sup> Street NW, Suite 100  
Washington, DC 20036  
T: (202) 293-2828 x 12  
[apedersen@maldef.org](mailto:apedersen@maldef.org)

Beth S. Brinkmann  
Mark B. Stern  
Michael P. Abate  
Daniel Tenny  
Jeffrey E. Sandberg  
C. Lee Reeves, II  
William H. Orrick, III  
Benjamin M. Shultz  
Tony West  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Room 7215

Ramona Albin  
Praveen S. Krishna  
Joyce White Vance  
U. S. Attorney's Office  
1801 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue N  
Birmingham, AL 35203-2101  
[ramona.albin@usdoj.gov](mailto:ramona.albin@usdoj.gov)  
[praveen.krishna@usdoj.gov](mailto:praveen.krishna@usdoj.gov)  
[joyce.vance@usdoj.gov](mailto:joyce.vance@usdoj.gov)

Varu Chilakamarri  
Joshua Wilkinfeld  
C. Lee Reeves, II  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division  
20 Massachusetts Ave, NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
[lee.reeves@usdoj.gov](mailto:lee.reeves@usdoj.gov)  
[varudhini.chilakamarri@usdoj.gov](mailto:varudhini.chilakamarri@usdoj.gov)  
[joshua.wilkinfeld@usdoj.gov](mailto:joshua.wilkinfeld@usdoj.gov)

950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20530-0001  
[beth.brinkmann@usdoj.gov](mailto:beth.brinkmann@usdoj.gov)  
[mark.stern@usdoj.gov](mailto:mark.stern@usdoj.gov)  
[michael.abate@usdoj.gov](mailto:michael.abate@usdoj.gov)  
[daniel.tenny@usdoj.gov](mailto:daniel.tenny@usdoj.gov)  
[jeffrey.e.sandberg@usdoj.gov](mailto:jeffrey.e.sandberg@usdoj.gov)

James Uriah Blacksher  
P.O. Box 636  
Birmingham, AL 35201  
[jblacksher@ns.sympatico.ca](mailto:jblacksher@ns.sympatico.ca)

s/ John C. Neiman, Jr.  
\_\_\_\_\_  
OF COUNSEL